

**PAKISTAN
DALIT
SOLIDARITY
NETWORK**



SECRETARIAT: **PILER CENTRE**
ST-001, Sector X, Sub-Sector V,
Gulshan-e-Maymar, Karachi-75340
Phones # (92-21) 6351145-46-47
Fax # (92-21)6350345

IDS N International Dalit Solidarity Network
WORKING GLOBALLY AGAINST CASTE-BASED DISCRIMINATION

Universal Periodic Review (UPR) Pakistan 2017 Discrimination against Dalits in Pakistan

**JOINT NGO SUBMISSION RELATED TO THE REVIEW OF PAKISTAN AT THE 28TH
UNIVERSAL PERIODIC REVIEW SESSION**

Prepared and submitted by:

Pakistan Dalit Solidarity Network

PILER Centre ST-001
Sector X, Sub Sector V
Gulshan e Maymar
Karachi Sindh 74900
Tel: +92 213 635 114 5/7
Email: info@piler.org.pk

International Dalit Solidarity Network

Rosenørns Allé 12
DK-1634
Copenhagen V
Denmark
Tel: +45 6043 3432 /30 /31 /33
Email: info@idsn.org

Content

I. Introduction	2.
II. Discrimination against Dalits in Pakistan	3.
III. Implementation of UPR recommendations	3.
IV. General Recommendations	10.
Notes	11.

I. Introduction

To date Pakistan has completed two cycles of the Universal Periodic Review, the first in 2008 and the second in 2012. This submission is for the 3rd cycle review due in November 2017. During the first review Pakistan received several recommendations regarding the protection of religious minorities and three states specifically raised the issue of caste-based discrimination and Scheduled Castes (increasingly referred to as Dalits). Similarly, in 2012 Pakistan received two specific recommendations on caste-based discrimination and protection of Scheduled Castes, as well as several for the protection of religious minorities.

This joint submission focuses on the accepted recommendations by the Government of Pakistan (GoP) from the second review cycle in 2012, concerning caste-based discrimination and protection of Dalits and minorities in Pakistan. The observations are based on government data and reports, independent studies, and recommendations by the UN, including the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD), which reviewed Pakistan in 2016.

This NGO report has been jointly prepared by the following organisations:

THE PAKISTAN DALIT SOLIDARITY NETWORK (PDSN) is a coalition of over two dozen rights-based civil society organizations in Pakistan. It was formally launched on 5th April 2009 after a research study conducted in 2007, which identified serious violations of basic rights of Scheduled Castes (Dalits) in Pakistan. The main objectives of the network are to highlight the issue of Scheduled Castes through national and international advocacy.

THE INTERNATIONAL DALIT SOLIDARITY NETWORK (IDSN) is an international network that works on a global level for the elimination of caste discrimination and similar forms of discrimination based on work and descent. Members include national Dalit platforms in caste-affected countries, Dalit Solidarity Networks in seven European countries, and international associates among others. PDSN is a member of IDSN. www.idsn.org

II. Discrimination against Dalits in Pakistan

The most recent official data, from 1998, estimates that the Dalit population in Pakistan is 330,000ⁱ people. However, this data does not include ‘lower castes’ within the Muslim community, living under similarly depressed conditionsⁱⁱ, and representatives of Scheduled Castes claim that the actual number could be at least two millionⁱⁱⁱ.

As religious minorities in Pakistan, Hindus and Christians are suffering discrimination in an Islamic society. Dalits fall victim to caste-based discrimination, including the practice of ‘untouchability’, which is obvious in all spheres of private and public life. As a result, Scheduled Castes often live in separate colonies, may be served food in separate crockery, and not allowed to sit inside with upper castes. Thus Scheduled Castes/ Dalits suffer double or intersecting forms of discrimination.

A number of the 2nd UPR cycle recommendations have not been implemented and caste-based discrimination against Dalits continues to be a serious issue in Pakistan. In its 2016 Concluding Observations on Pakistan, the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination expressed its deep concerns about ‘the de facto existence of the Scheduled Castes (Dalits) and the continuing discrimination against them, particularly in employment and education’ as well as ‘abduction of Dalit women and girls for the purpose of forced conversion to Islam and forced marriage’^{iv}. The Committee recommended (para 32):

Recalling its general recommendation No. 29 (2002) on article 1 (1) of the Convention (Descent), the Committee recommends that the State party take the measures necessary to end discrimination against Dalits, particularly in accessing employment and education. It urges the State party to take immediate action to end the forced conversion and forced marriage of Christian and Hindu Dalit women and to prosecute and punish the abductors with penalties commensurate with the gravity of the crime. It requests the State party to include information on the situation of Dalits in the country, including relevant statistical data, in its next periodic report.

Additionally, the Special Rapporteur on Minority Issues in her annual report 2016 on caste-based discrimination noted that Dalits in South Asia, including in Pakistan, are most affected by humanitarian crisis, yet less likely to receive assistance and ‘suffer from acute caste discrimination throughout all the phases of disaster response, from rescue to rehabilitation. They are also the most affected by climate change due to living in flood- and drought-prone areas’^v.

III. Implementation of UPR recommendations

CASTE-BASED DISCRIMINATION RECOMMENDATIONS

UPR recommendation No. 122.92 (ACCEPTED)

CONTINUE ITS EFFORTS FOR THE IMPROVEMENT OF THE HEALTH SYSTEM AND THE ELIMINATION OF DISCRIMINATION AGAINST WOMEN AND DISCRIMINATION ON THE BASIS OF CASTE (HOLY SEE).

Status of Implementation

In Pakistan, the infrastructure of the health sector is relatively strong consisting of 5349 Basic Health Units, 562 Rural Health Centers, 945 hospitals, 4755 dispensaries, 903 maternal health centers and 290 TB centers^{vi}. Yet functionally it is very poor, lacking significant resources, with issues of corruption, poor monitoring of the system and embedded discrimination. Only 2.0% of Pakistan's GDP is spent on the health sector compared to 5-14% in developed countries. As a result, Pakistan's health indicators are very poor compared to global trends. The country is among the 115 countries which recognize the right to public healthcare yet discriminates against women, especially in rural areas^{vii}.

The Scheduled Caste population in the country is mainly concentrated in rural areas, in Sindh and South Punjab, therefore they face intense deprivation of basic necessities such as education, health and an adequate standards of living. Scheduled Caste communities face gender and caste-based discrimination when trying to gain access to hospitals. The GoP has failed to take any concrete, tangible and preventive measure to stop discrimination on the basis of caste in the health sector.

Recommendations

- The GoP should review its resource allocations to the health sector and give particular attention to the principles of equity and equality. Resources should be allocated not only towards urban populations but also towards rural areas, ensuring equal access to quality health care services for everyone.
- The GoP should commit to taking serious measures to strengthen equal access to basic services, with an emphasis on the most marginalised communities, including Scheduled Castes.

UPR recommendation No. 122.103 (ACCEPTED)

TAKE EFFECTIVE MEASURES TO PREVENT FORCED OR EARLY MARRIAGE, IN PARTICULAR WITH A VIEW TO ENDING RAPE, SEXUAL EXPLOITATION AND FORCED CONVERSIONS OF SCHEDULED CASTE GIRLS (AUSTRIA).

UPR recommendation No. 122.102 (ACCEPTED)

TAKE STEPS TO IMPLEMENT LAWS AND POLICIES WITH A VIEW TO ELIMINATING EARLY AND FORCED MARRIAGE (CANADA).

Status of Implementation

In the last five years a number of girls from minority communities have been abducted, forcibly converted to Islam and forced to marry^{viii}. As Pakistan lacks effective laws to improve the situation^{ix} the trend has increased in recent years and was recently addressed by the Special Rapporteur on Minority Issues in her latest thematic report to the human rights council (A/HRC/31/56)^x. The worst victims are scheduled caste Hindu girls who are kidnapped or lured into conversion, sexually exploited and then abandoned^{xi}.

In a 2012 UPR report, it was estimated that on average some 700 Christian and 300 Hindu girls are forcibly converted to Islam each year in Pakistan, notably in Punjab, Khyber Pakhtun Kha and Sindh provinces^{xii}. Together with Pakistan institute for Labour Education and Research (PILER), PDSN has previously appealed to the government to take notice of the abductions of Dalit girls and their forceful conversions to Islam. Despite the 2011 Prevention of Anti-women Practices Act, which abolishes the practice of forced marriages and the exchange of girls in settling disputes, as well as the marriage of minor girls, it is found that the police refuse to intervene in such cases. Even the courts are complicit in this, by nullifying

women’s previous non-Islamic marriages and recognizing their forced marriages instead (ALRC and Act-France, UPR 2012).

The Sindh Child Marriage Restraint Act from 2013 prohibits marriage before the age of 18, in Sindh province. However, the courts are failing to implement the law, especially in cases concerning Hindu Dalit minors. The absence of birth registration and marriage certificates among the Scheduled Caste Hindu community are significant hurdles to the implementation of the Child Marriage Restraint Act. The police and judiciary attitudes have been observed to be biased towards minorities and Dalits.

Several cases of minor Scheduled Caste Hindu girls have been reported in the media without an avail. To give an example, in 2015 an 11 year old Hindu Dalit girl (Seema Oad^{xiii}) was kidnapped from Shaheed Benazirabad District in Sindh. She was converted and finally married off to a Muslim boy within a couple of days. The case was assessed in the High Court of Sindh. After several hearings and providing evidence on the girl’s age the court decided that rather than punishing culprits and sending the girl to her parents, to send her to a Government shelter home until she reaches 18 years of age when she will be handed over to the abductors. The case clearly indicates a violation of child rights and the recently adopted Child Marriage Restraint Act 2013.

In November 2016, the Provincial Assembly of Sindh passed a bill titled the Criminal Law (Protection of Minorities) bill 2016, which recognises forcing a child under 18 years of age to change their religion and enter into a marriage as a punishable offence. However, some religious and extremist groups argued that the bill is against the teachings of Islam. Consequently, the Governor of Sindh did not sign the bill against forced conversions unanimously adopted by the Sindh Assembly^{xiv}.

Forced conversions is a serious issue and has been affecting the Dalit community for many years^{xv}, however, other than those mentioned there have been no initiatives undertaken by the GoP at any other federal or province level to criminalise child marriage or forced conversions. The problems of forced conversions and forced marriage are interlinked as many young scheduled caste girls are forced into conversion by way of marriage.

Recommendations

- The GoP should pass the Criminal Law (Protection of Minorities) Bill 2016 without any delay and adopt it in the other three provinces of Pakistan.
- The GoP should take effective measures to prevent and investigate cases of forced conversions of girls, with an emphasis on the most vulnerable groups such as Scheduled Caste girls.
- The GoP should eliminate multiple forms of discrimination experienced by Dalit women on the basis of caste and gender in accordance with the CEDAW General Recommendations 25 and 28.
- The GoP should undertake free and mandatory birth registration for all children and support Scheduled Caste communities in obtaining birth certificates for their children, by arranging NADRA camps in the villages of Scheduled Caste people.

BONDED LABOUR

UPR recommendation No. 122.60 (ACCEPTED)

DEVELOP A CLEAR IMPLEMENTATION AND MONITORING PLAN FOR THE BONDED LABOUR SYSTEM (ABOLITION) ACT, 1992, THE BONDED LABOUR SYSTEM (ABOLITION) RULES, 1995 AND THE NATIONAL POLICY AND PLAN OF ACTION FOR THE ABOLITION OF BONDED LABOUR, 2001 (IRELAND).

Status of Implementation

The Special Rapporteur on minority issues highlighted the intersectionality of caste and forced and bonded labour in Pakistan, and stated that Dalits, who are mainly minority Hindus, are disproportionately affected by forced and bonded labour, particularly in the Sindh and Balochistan provinces^{xvi}. Pakistan has ratified a number of international covenants and conventions which proscribe slavery, forced labour, and debt-bondage. The Constitution of Pakistan forbids slavery and forced labour, and the Bonded Labour System (Abolition) Act of 1992 along with the Bonded Labour System (Abolition) Rules of 1995 completely outlaw bonded labour. They also cancel all existing bonded debts and forbid lawsuits for the recovery of such debts. Yet, bonded labour in Pakistan is widespread, particularly in agriculture and brick making, and the majority of the bonded labour community belongs to marginalised and excluded groups such as the Scheduled Caste Hindus, Christians and Muslim Sheikhs. Scheduled Castes /Dalits lack basic facilities and face social, racial and psychological discrimination. According to the 2014 Global Slavery Index, 2,058,200 people are enslaved in Pakistan and the majority of them live in the Sindh and Punjab Provinces and are engaged in the agriculture and brick kin sector.^{xvii}

In its examination of Pakistan in May 2016, the Committee on the Rights of the Child expressed serious concern over the continuous practice of bonded and forced labour affecting vulnerable children, including Dalit children, and urged the GoP to eradicate all forms of bonded and forced labour of children, and in particular children from marginalised and disadvantaged groups such as Dalit children, and bring the responsible employers to justice. Moreover, the CERD examined Pakistan in 2016 and in its concluding observations expressed deep concerns that:

‘despite the adoption of the Bonded Labour System (Abolition) Act of 1992, bonded labour practices persist in the State party, particularly in the brick kiln and textile industries and among the Scheduled Castes (Dalits). It appears that the Act has not been effectively implemented owing to the lack of awareness about it among people working under debt-bondage and among law enforcement and judicial officials (arts. 1 and 5)’^{xviii}. The Committee recommended to take measures to fully implement the Act and intensify labour inspections into workplaces where ‘there is a high risk of forced and bonded labour, particularly in the informal economy sector, and investigate cases of labour discrimination and labour exploitation’.

Following the 18th amendment in the constitution of Pakistan in 2010, Sindh, Punjab and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa provinces adopted Bonded Labour System (Abolition) Act 2015. However, even with the laws criminalising bonded labour practice in Pakistan the government failed to secure a single conviction of the bonded labour perpetrators. The Government also failed to take any steps against the duty bearers who did not make any serious efforts to implement this law at grassroots and district levels.

Recommendations

- Ensure an effective implementation of the Bonded Labour System (Abolition) Act 2015, establish effective district vigilance committees and ensure immediate rehabilitation of the freed bonded labourers so they can get out of bondage.
- The GoP should ensure that Scheduled Caste peasants are given their due share of agricultural productions, so that labourers are not subjected to bonded labour. This can be achieved by making progressive changes in the Tenancy Legislation (especially the Sindh Tenancy Act).
- The GoP should implement international conventions and treaties abolishing bonded labour.
- The GoP should extend an invitation to the UN Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of slavery.

MINORITIES

UPR recommendation No. 122.87 (ACCEPTED)

TAKE DETERRENT MEASURES TO COMBAT DISCRIMINATION AGAINST WOMEN, GIRLS AND RELIGIOUS MINORITIES AND WORK TOWARDS ELIMINATING POVERTY AMONG THOSE GROUPS (IRAQ).

Status of Implementation

Since the first UPR the GoP has taken no specific actions aimed at eliminating the practice of discrimination on the basis of caste or eradicating poverty among Scheduled Castes. Scheduled Caste Hindus face discrimination in availing economic opportunities or start their own business, hence they suffer from high degrees of poverty. No major scheme was launched for this group, except by largely employing them in manual (sanitation) work that other majority groups are unwilling to do.

The CERD recommendation from 2009 to adopt a law prohibiting discrimination on the basis of caste has not been implemented and the concern of the “persisting de facto segregation of and discrimination against Dalits regarding their enjoyment of all economic, civil, political, and social rights” in paragraph 12 of the Concluding Observations (CERD/C/PAK/CO/20)^{xix} has not been addressed. The implementation of the 5% job quota for minorities continues to be poor despite the direction from the Supreme Court in 2014.

Recommendations:

- The GoP should adopt a law prohibiting discrimination on the basis of caste and take effective and immediate measures to ensure its effective implementation to protect those discriminated against on the basis of caste, as recommended by the CERD.
- The GoP should endorse and make use of the draft UN Principles and Guidelines for the effective Elimination of Discrimination based on Work and Descent as a comprehensive framework to eliminate caste discrimination.
- The GoP should provide information on the concrete measures taken to combat caste-based discrimination and statistical data on the persons belonging to Scheduled Castes in the next periodic report to the CERD and in other treaty body reports as recommended.
- The GoP should restore the 6% job quota for Scheduled Castes in government services and announce a quota in higher education so the Scheduled Castes can get quality jobs in higher positions.

UPR recommendation No. 122.113 (ACCEPTED)

INVESTIGATE ATTACKS AND VIOLENCE AGAINST RELIGIOUS MINORITIES AND SECTS AND BRING THOSE RESPONSIBLE TO JUSTICE (NORWAY).

UPR recommendation No. 122.157 (ACCEPTED)

TAKE APPROPRIATE, EFFICIENT MEASURES TO PREVENT DISCRIMINATION AND VIOLENCE AGAINST RELIGIOUS MINORITIES, BRINGING INSTIGATORS TO RELIGIOUS VIOLENCE TO JUSTICE (SLOVAKIA).

Status of implementation

Since the last UPR of Pakistan religious motivated incidents that led to violence have been rising in Pakistan. In 2014, more than a dozen Hindu temples were attacked/ burned and looted in different districts of Sindh including Lakana, Sanghar, Hyderabad, Tharparkar, Umerkot, Mirpurkhas and Sukkur. Hundreds of angry Pakistanis attacked a Hindu temple and set it on fire in Larkana, Sindh Province^{xx}. During the period several incidents were reported about killings/ murders of Dalit and minority people but the law enforcement agencies rarely investigated the incidents or arrested culprits and criminals who were involved in the killings and attacks on religious sites.

In June 2014, the Supreme Court of Pakistan took *suo moto* and issued a landmark judgment for the protection of religious minorities in Pakistan. If it is implemented in a true spirit it could provide a better protection and relief to religious minorities in Pakistan. However, in the 2016 examination of Pakistan the CERD expressed its deep concerns about, “the reportedly high incidence of hate crimes such as harassment, violent mobs and killings of persons belonging to ethnic and religious minorities, particularly Hazaras, Christian Dalits, Hindu Dalits and Ahmadis, and the absence of investigation and prosecution.”^{xxi} It recommended to enhance reporting, prosecute the perpetrators, provide effective remedies to the victims, and take comprehensive measures to combat and condemn hate crimes.

Recommendations

The GoP should implement the Supreme Court’s Jurisdiction, particularly directions number IV, V and VII.

- IV: constitute a National Council for minorities’ rights. The function of the said Council should be *inter alia* to monitor the practical realisation of the rights and safeguards provided to the minorities under the Constitution and law. The Council should also be mandated to frame policy recommendations for safeguarding and protecting minorities’ rights by the Provincial and Federal Government.
- V: Establish a Special Police Force with professional training to protect the places of worship of minorities.
- VII: In all cases of violation of any of the rights guaranteed under the law or desecration of the places of worship of minorities, the concerned Law Enforcement Agencies should promptly take action including the registration of criminal cases against the delinquents.

UPR recommendation No. 122.121 (ACCEPTED)

CONTINUE EFFORTS TO ENHANCE LEGISLATIONS AND MEASURES TO FURTHER ADDRESS THE SITUATION OF RELIGIOUS MINORITIES, INCLUDING BLASPHEMY LAWS, FORCE CONVERSION AND DISCRIMINATION AGAINST NONMUSLIM MINORITIES (THAILAND)

UPR recommendation No. 122.156 (ACCEPTED)

ADOPT MESURES TO ENSURE THE PROTECTION OF RELIGIOUS MINORITIES, INCLUDING AHMADIS, CHRISTIANS, HINDUS AND SIKHS, PREVENT THE ABUSE OF BLASPHEMY LEGISLATION, HALT FORCED CONVERSIONS, AND TAKE NECESSARY STEPS TO PREVENT VIOLENCE AGAINST MEMBERS OF RELIGIOUS MINORITY COMMUNITIES (CANADA).

UPR recommendation No. 122.158 (ACCEPTED)

ENFORCE THE MEASURES AND POLICIES THAT PAKISTAN HAS UNDERTAKEN TO ENSURE THE PARTICIPATION OF MINORITIES IN AN APPROPRIATE WAY IN THE POLITICAL LIFE (LIBYAN ARAB JAMAHIRIYA).

Status of implementation

Religious discrimination is a serious issue in modern day Pakistan. Issues of religious minorities have been raised a number of times by civil society human rights organizations and parliamentarians on the floor of the assembly and media but to no avail.^{xxii} Although the Sindh Government provincial assembly took an initiative and passed the Criminal Law (Protection of Minorities) bill 2016, which stops forced conversion of minority girls below 18, it was opposed and blocked by some religious and extremist groups. In the last five years there was no debate on the issue of blasphemy laws due to the rise of extremism, militant religious groups, and shrinking space of freedom of expression. There was no progress or specific effort from Government to prohibit discrimination on the basis of caste or religion and no legislation on the issue of forced conversion.

There is a lack of political participation of religious minorities in the parliament. Article 51(2A) of the constitution of Pakistan provides 10 reserved seats for religious minorities in the National Assembly, and 23 seats for minorities in the four provincial assemblies under Article 106. Unfortunately, these reserved seats are often filled by persons who are neither competent nor representative of their supposed electorate. The concept of the model of ‘proportional representation’ has, in fact, been abused and the notion of representation has been defeated by the political leadership of the nation.^{xxiii}

Recommendations

- Implement systems ensuring effective political participation of minorities and their true representation in all political parties in Pakistan, reserving 5% of general seats to minority candidates. Selection of those for reserved seats should be done by the minority community itself not by a political party.
- The GoP should make attempts to amend or repeal the blasphemy law that facilitates persecution of religious minorities and legitimizes impunity for perpetrators of violence against religious minorities.

HUMAN RIGHTS EDUCATION

UPR recommendation No. 122.152 (ACCEPTED)

INCLUDE HUMAN RIGHTS EDUCATION IN SCHOOL CURRICULAR (PALESTINE).

Status of Implementation

The current public school curriculum in Pakistan contains derogatory remarks against religious minorities, inciting religious hatred and bias, and treating non-Muslim students unequally, violating article 25 (1) of the Constitution of Pakistan, which guarantees equality and equal protection for all citizens.

There were some positive developments in the last few years as the provincial and national Government started a process of reforming curriculum and included human rights in the text books. In 2016, Sindh High Court (SHC) under the public interest litigation directed the provincial education ministry to teach

human rights at schools and promote peace in society through education, but the progress is still very slow.^{xxiv}

Moreover, on 22 February 2017, the National Assembly Standing Committee on Federal Education and Professional Training unanimously passed the “Compulsory Teaching of the Holy Quran Bill 2017” for students at levels 1 to 12. This is the opposite of the promises made that the Holy Quran would only be taught to Muslim students. Islamic lessons are already being taught to non-Muslim students from class one onward. There are no arrangements for religious education of non-Muslim students.

Recommendations

- The GoP needs to expedite the process of including human rights education in school curricular and involve National and Provincial Human Rights Commissions and human rights experts from religious minorities.
- The GoP should reform the school curriculum to ensure it complies with article 22 of the Constitution of Pakistan and international human rights treaties, including the Universal Declaration on Human Rights and UNESCO guidelines.

IV. General Recommendations

Following the upcoming 2017 census the GoP should introduce a development package for Scheduled Caste (Dalits) according to their population in the country. This development package may include:

- Meaningful political participation of Scheduled Castes through increasing reserved seats in legislative bodies – such as senate, provincial and national assemblies,
- Restoration of a 6% job quota and reserve quotas in higher education.
- Introduce special housing schemes and distribution of land among Scheduled Caste landless populations.
- The GoP should take effective steps to ensure the safety and protection of human rights, minority rights and Dalit rights defenders.
- Through the National and Provincial Commission of Minorities the GoP should identify suitable policy frameworks and national programmes to prevent and tackle caste discrimination by involving the UN experts and national and international human rights institutions /experts.
- UN member countries are called to give specific recommendations on the issues of Dalits and minorities in the 3rd cycle of the UPR review of Pakistan, as the follow up of those generic recommendations seems extremely difficult for civil society. GoP should also focus to accept specific recommendations along with generic.

Notes

ⁱ Pakistan population census 1998: www.pbs.gov.pk/population-tables.

ⁱⁱ Source: “Long Behind Schedule: A Study on the Plight of Scheduled Castes in Pakistan” (2008). The focus of the study is on Pakistan’s Scheduled Castes residing in lower districts of Sindh and Southern Punjab in Pakistan. It was part of a Regional Study on Caste-based Discrimination in South Asia, and is available here: http://idsn.org/fileadmin/user_folder/pdf/Old_files/asia/pdf/RR_Pakistan.pdf

ⁱⁱⁱ “Caste-based discrimination in Pakistan”, International Dalit Solidarity Network briefing note (May 2014).

^{iv} Concluding observations on the combined twenty-first and twenty-third periodic reports of Pakistan, October 2016, page 6, para 31 & 32. Available here: http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CERD%2fC%2fPAK%2fCO%2f21-23&Lang=en

^v Iszak-Ndiaye, Rita, “Minorities and discrimination based on caste and analogous systems of inherited status” Report to the 31st Session of the Human Rights Council (A/HRC/31/56), 2016: <http://idsn.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/Special-Rapporteur-on-minority-issues-report-on-caste.pdf>

^{vi} Health Sector of Pakistan: Redefining Roles and Overcoming Challenges. Submitted by Neelam Punjani in 2014, available at: <http://blogs.jpmonline.com/2014/04/29/health-sector-of-pakistan-redefining-roles-and-overcoming-challenges/>

^{vii} The express tribute, Pakistan. Discrimination: For women in rural areas, healthcare not a basic right. Available at: <https://tribune.com.pk/story/573754/discrimination-for-women-in-rural-areas-healthcare-not-a-basic-right/>

^{viii} Pakistan Dalit Solidarity Network and International Dalit Solidarity Network, “Scheduled caste women in Pakistan: denied a life in dignity and respect”, alternative report to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women at its fifty-fourth session (2013), p. 12.

^{ix} The Wire. Bring Back Our Girls: Pakistan’s Hindus Struggle Against Forced Conversions. Available at: <https://thewire.in/99522/pakistan-minorities-girls/>

^x The same at reference v.

^{xi} Pakistan Dalit Solidarity Network and International Dalit Solidarity Network, “Scheduled caste children in Pakistan”, alternative report to the Committee on the Rights of the Child at its 72nd session (2015), p. 9. Available here: <http://idsn.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/07/IDSN-and-PDSN-alternative-report-on-Scheduled-Caste-Children-in-Pakistan-July-2015-CRC-Pakistan.pdf>

^{xii} UPR Stakeholder submission by the Asian Legal Resource Centre and ACT-France, 23 April 2012.

^{xiii} Daily Kawish October 4, 2015

^{xiv} Geo TV, 7 January 2017, “Sindh governor returns forced conversion bill”. Available at: <https://www.geo.tv/latest/126435-Sindh-governor-returns-forced-conversion-bill>

^{xv} Jinnah Institute, “A question of faith -a report on the status of religious minorities in Pakistan, research report, 2011: http://www.jinnah-institute.org/images/stories/jinnah_minority_report.pdf (last accessed 29-03-2017)

^{xvi} Anti-Slavery International, Poverty, Discrimination and Slavery: The Reality of Bonded Labour in India, Nepal and Pakistan (2008), p. 14.

^{xvii} Daily times, 19 February, 2015, “Bonded labour in Pakistan: a humanitarian crisis”. Available at: <http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/opinion/20-Feb-2015/bonded-labour-in-pakistan-a-humanitarian-crisis>

^{xviii} The same at reference iv, page 6, para 27.

^{xix} Consideration of reports submitted by state parties under article 9 of the convention. Concluding observations of the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination: Pakistan, 2009. Available at: http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CERD%2fC%2fPAK%2fCO%2f20&Lang=en

^{xx} Reuters, 16 March 2014, “Hindu temple set on fire in Pakistan over blasphemy”. Available at: <http://in.reuters.com/article/pakistan-hindu-temple-fire-idINDEEA2F07G20140316>

^{xxi} The same at reference as iv, paragraph 15.

^{xxii} Lal Chand Malhi, Member of National Assembly, published in Tribune 8 September 2016, “Who will protect the minorities?” Available at: <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1178857/will-protect-minorities/>

^{xxiii} Naeem Shakir, 30 August 2016, published in the Dawn, “Minorities’ seats”. Available at: <https://www.dawn.com/news/1280797>

^{xxiv} Tribune, 4 February 2016, “Promoting tolerance: education dept has four weeks to add human rights to curriculum”. Available at: <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1039805/promoting-tolerance-education-dept-has-four-weeks-to-add-human-rights-to-curriculum/>